



Office of the City Manager

INFORMATION CALENDAR  
November 3, 2022

To: Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council

From: Dee Williams-Ridley, City Manager

Submitted by: Liam Garland, Director, Department of Public Works

Subject: Audit Status Report: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress towards the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal

INTRODUCTION

The Office of the City Auditor presented a July 1, 2014 Report to the City Council: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress towards the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal<sup>1</sup> (Audit Report). The City Auditor conducted the Audit Report at the Public Works Director's request to assess Zero Waste Division's progress towards the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal. This is the fifth and final status report on the efforts made to implement the Audit Report's recommendations, which are slated for no further follow-up action as recommended by the City Auditor for all audits more than five years old.

CURRENT SITUATION AND ITS EFFECTS

The Audit Report noted fifteen (15) recommendations for the Public Works Department (PWD) and its Zero Waste Division (ZWD) to review, implement and report to Council. The first set of seven (7) recommendations was related to zero waste goals and ZWD's operational components, and the second set of eight (8) recommendations focused on collaborating with the Department of Information Technology (IT) to utilize technology to interface with Zero Waste routes, staff, and the customers.

Since the January 15, 2020 update on this Audit Report, Public Works has made additional progress on the implementation of recommendations. At the time of this report, the Auditor's Office verified three (3) of the recommendations as implemented and dropped the remaining twelve (12) recommendations.

BACKGROUND

Public Works' Zero Waste Division is responsible for the collection of residential material, including refuse, recycling, and composting; collection and processing of commercial material, including refuse, recycling, and composting; off-site hauling and

---

<sup>1</sup> [https://www.cityofberkeley.info/uploadedFiles/Auditor/Level\\_3\\_-\\_General/A%20RPT\\_Zero%20Waste\\_Final.pdf](https://www.cityofberkeley.info/uploadedFiles/Auditor/Level_3_-_General/A%20RPT_Zero%20Waste_Final.pdf)

composting of green/food waste for all customers; off-site hauling, sorting, and marketing of construction and demolition debris for all customers; and manages contracts related to the above work.

On March 22, 2015, the Berkeley City Council adopted Zero Waste Resolution No. 62,849-N.S. setting a goal of zero waste sent to landfills by the year 2020. The Resolution does not define a specific zero waste percentage expectation for Berkeley, but the language used therein suggests diversion of 100% of waste from landfills.

In its October 17, 2017 presentation to the City Council, the Zero Waste Commission recommended attaining the City's Zero Waste goal requires redefining the Zero Waste Goal and issuing a Request for Proposal (RFP) for a Zero Waste Management Strategic Plan. The City Council approved this recommendation.

On April 28, 2022, the City released the RFP, seeking qualified firms for the development and completion of an Integrated Zero Waste Management Strategic Plan (Plan) to provide methodologies and guidance for the City's Zero Waste Division's operation, personnel, program, and financial requirements to meet the City's Climate Action Plan and Zero Waste goals. The Plan's development will include robust public participation and outreach, along with City Council and staff input on both the draft and final Plan. City Council approved an item at the October 8, 2022 meeting to enter into a contract with the selected consultant for the Plan's development.

#### ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY AND CLIMATE IMPACTS

The increased diversion of compostable and recyclable materials is an essential part of the City's Zero Waste Goal as described in the City's 2009 Climate Action Plan.

#### POSSIBLE FUTURE ACTION

Public Works' Zero Waste Division and the Zero Waste Commission will continue to take timely and focused action(s) to address outstanding and partially implemented recommendations.

#### FISCAL IMPACTS OF POSSIBLE FUTURE ACTION

The Integrated Zero Waste Management Strategic Plan has an approved budget of \$500,000. The AMCS financial software platform and associated professional services are budgeted for \$1.3 million for the first five years. There may be additional financial impacts to complete the remaining Audit findings.

#### CONTACT PERSON

Greg Apa, Solid Waste & Recycling Manager (510) 981-6359

Attachment:

1. Audit Findings and Recommendations Response Form

ATTACHMENT No. 1

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
<b>Finding 1: Insufficient data and resources (for planning, strategy, or execution) dedicated to Berkeley's zero waste by 2020 resolution</b>				
1.1	Request the City Council to redefine and then reaffirm its commitment to zero waste (i.e., the percentage that the Council considers to be success), and to ensure sufficient resources to fund appropriate staffing and the necessary infrastructure to achieve stated goals by 2020.	Public Works	Agree This is consistent with the strategic approach the Public Works Department has taken to correct operational deficiencies and create an organization more capable of continuing the work to reach the City's zero waste goal.  The Department is poised to undertake an open search for a new ZWD Manager whose input, perspective, and anticipated professional expertise will be essential in analyzing the resources necessary to achieve the goal and drafting suitable recommendations to Council.	<p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</p> <p><b>January 23, 2018 Update:</b> <b>Not Implemented</b> The Zero Waste Commission submitted to the City Council its recommendation for the City to develop an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The City Council concurred with this recommendation which was an item on its October 17, 2017 Action Calendar for the Zero Waste Division to develop the RFP for the development of the Plan.</p> <p><b>6/04,2018 Update:</b> <b>Not Implemented</b> The RFP is in development and should be released to solicit proposals to be submitted during the second quarter FY2019.</p> <p><b>March 12, 2019</b> <b>Partially Implemented</b> ZWD has developed an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The RFP is in administrative review.</p> <p><b>March 24, 2020 Update</b> <b>Partially Implemented</b> At the September 17, 2019 City Council Work Session, Public and its consultant presented the proposed 5-year Rate Review that includes additional staffing for implementation and compliance with State and StopWaste.org mandatory recycling and food waste. The Council provided input on the Rate Review is in review and adjusted Rates with be presented to the City Council mid-2020.</p> <p><b>November 13, 2022 Update</b> <b>Dropped</b> Revised 5-year Rate Schedules presented at the December 7, 2021 City Council Work Session. Council consented to moving forward with Proposition 218 process to approve Rates as proposed. In January</p>
			June 2015 June 2019	
			June 2019	
			December 2019	
			November 2020	
			July 2023	

ATTACHMENT No. 1

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
				2022, The City Agenda Committee placed the revised 5-year rate schedules on pause.
1.2 Draft and obtain Council approval of a written strategic plan to achieve zero waste by 2020, including annual or biennial interim waste diversion goals. Topics that the strategic plan should discuss include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Objectives and long-term and interim goals</li> <li>Actions to be taken</li> <li>Responsible parties</li> <li>Expected cost and impact of implementation</li> <li>Performance measures</li> <li>External factors affecting performance and progress</li> </ul>	Public Works	<p>Agree</p> <p>The Public Works Department has taken a strategic approach to solving the structural deficit and making progress toward our Zero Waste goal. The Department improved the efficiency of operations, followed the strategies in the Climate Action Plan, is currently completing a commercial franchise study, and in May 2014 completed a Prop 218-compliant rate increase. PW will continue to focus on maintaining efficient operations, high quality customer service, and improvements to waste diversion efforts.</p> <p>The Department will take the next step toward zero waste by reassessing the current situation, and developing a strategic plan intended to guide the Department through the increasingly difficult path to zero waste. Part of this process requires evaluating the existing Transfer Station infrastructure, along with what might be required to reach the Zero Waste goal as defined.</p> <p>The strategic plan will be flexible so that annual work plans can be designed to address changing conditions.</p> <p>Public Works will build upon relevant</p>	<p>June 2015</p> <p>June 2019</p> <p>June 2019</p> <p>December 2019</p> <p>May 2021</p>	<p>2022, The City Agenda Committee placed the revised 5-year rate schedules on pause.</p> <p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</p> <p><b>January 23, 2018 Update:</b> <b>Not Implemented</b> The City's Solid Waste Management Plan (1998) and Source Reduction and Recycling Element (1992) are the City's most recent documents guiding the City's actions toward the goal of zero waste. Although the City's Solid Waste Management Plan Update (2005) wasn't formerly adopted by the City, it was designed to achieve the 2010 goal of reaching 75% diversion. The City is currently achieving 76% diversion based on FY2015 information. The Zero Waste Commission and the City Auditor each concluded independently that a comprehensive, written strategic plan that clearly defines roles and responsibilities and assigns sufficient resources is needed to guide the City towards the goal of achieving zero waste. The Zero Waste Commission recommended and the City Council concurred at its October 17, 2017 Action Calendar concurred with Zero Waste Commission's recommendation for Public Works' Zero Waste Division to develop an RFP to: develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan to delineate terminology, define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and develop plan to attain the defined Strategic Plan's Zero Waste Goal.</p> <p><b>6/04,2018 Update:</b> <b>Not Implemented</b> These issues will be included in the development of RFP that will be advertised for proposals the second quarter FY2019.</p> <p><b>March 12, 2019</b> <b>Partially Implemented</b> ZWD has developed an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The RFP is in administrative review.</p> <p><b>March 24, 2020 Update</b> <b>Partially Implemented</b> With installation and implementation of the Zero Waste Division's management software (vendor is AMCS and projected to be</p>



ATTACHMENT No. 1

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
			<p>May 2022</p> <p>August 2024</p>	<p>City's policy and decision making and paths of implementation to the goal of Zero Waste. IT and ZWD are in the process of selecting a vendor to implement an entirely new ZW software solution that includes routing, billing and work orders. ZW meets weekly with key PW staff to ensure division objectives and action items are prioritized and budgeted for. With the first reading and passing of the Single Use Foodware and Litter Reduction Ordinance on January 22, 2019, ZWD is working closely with PW Fiscal and Admin division to budget for adequate staffing for this new responsibility. ZWD anticipates completion of a Feasibility Study to replace the existing Transfer Station by mid-2019. ZWD primary objectives are in accordance with the Citywide Strategic Plan. Once the new ZW software system is in place and the Strategic Plan has been completed, a more accurate work plan could be created that would include performance measures.</p> <p><b>March 24, 2020 Update</b>  <b>Partially Implemented</b>                      With installation and implementation of the Zero Waste Division's management software (vendor is AMCS and projected to be completed late 2020), the City can assure Strategic Plan proposes that customers information is accurate and verifiable (FUND\$ cannot). With completion of this step, the City can issue an RFP for a new user-friendly routing system. With a new Routing system, reliable, verifiable and accurate performance metrics can be developed. The cost of these systems and additional staffing required have been included in projected budgets.</p> <p><b>November 13, 2022 Update</b>  <b>Dropped</b>                      The AMCS software financial platform will not be fully implemented until July 2024. An RFP for an Integrated Zero Waste Management Strategic Plan (Plan) was released April 28, 2022. An October 8, 2022 City Council Consent Item was submitted for award of contract for development of the Plan to the selected consultant. The implementation of the AMCS platform and the Plan development will be conducted and coordinated in unison.</p>
1.4	Public Works	<p>Agree</p> <p>Prepare an annual report to Council, highlighting progress toward strategic plan and work plan goals to achieve zero waste in Berkeley.</p>	December 2019	<p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</p> <p><b>January 23, 2018 Update:</b>  <b>Partially Implemented</b>                      With the newly re-staffed ZWC and new management at Zero Waste Division and once the Strategic Plan is completed and as part of the Strategic Plan, the Work Plan with goals, budget, timelines, FTEs and measurements will be developed. Then, Public Works will initiate</p>



ATTACHMENT No. 1

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
Berkeley achieve zero waste. This includes sharing strategic and annual work plan goals and regular updates regarding progress and completion.			November 2021	<p>annual reporting to Council. Nonetheless progress has been made, such as: the ZWD has undertaken a City Facilities Greening Project to ensure that all City-owned facilities have the appropriate containers with signage for trash, recyclables (bottles/cans and fiber), and organics; and that City staff receive training on the acceptable materials to place in each container type. The recent, May through September 2017, renovation of 1947 Center Street is being used as a pilot for this Project.</p> <p>In celebration of Earth Day 2017, the ZWD hosted a Zero Waste Earth Day Fair for City employees to get answers to all of their recycling-related questions, play games, enjoy zero waste snacks, and talk trash with ZWD staff. This event was attended by more than 100 City employees.</p> <p><b><u>March 12, 2019</u></b>  <b>Partially Implemented</b>                      City staff have been encouraged to participate in the visioning sessions for the Transfer Station Redesign January 16, 17, and 18, 2019. Also, ZWD has developed an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The RFP is in administrative review. Once the strategic plan is completed, it will be shared with City staff.</p>
			November 2021	<p><b><u>March 24, 2020 Update</u></b>  <b>Partially Implemented</b>                      At the Council's Work Sessions for Rate Review (September 17, 2019) and Solid Waste &amp; Recycling Transfer Station Feasibility Study (November 5, 2019), PW informed Council of the need for additional RFPs, staffing, funding and facility requirements to meet the City's zero waste goal.</p>
			August 2024	<p><b><u>November 13, 2022 Update</u></b>  <b>Dropped</b>                      Revised 5-year Rate Schedules was presented at the December 7, 2021 City Council Work Session. Council consented to moving forward with Proposition 218 process for property owner consent of the revised Rates as proposed. These Revised Schedules included additional costs for: 1) Ecology and CCC contracts (\$85 mil over 10 years, sole sourced per Council direction); staffing for AB 341 &amp; 1826 (commercial recycling), SB1383 (organic recycling) and Single Use</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
				Disposal Foodware and Litter Reduction Ordinance compliance; and CEQA compliance work for Transfer Station Replacement Concepts A and B. In January 2022, The City Agenda Committee placed the revised 5-year rate schedules on pause.
1.5 Determine if additional funds are needed for the education, outreach, compliance, and enforcement necessary to reach zero waste goals. If sufficient funds are not available, propose to Council a separate fee to cover those costs for the City's zero- waste program, such as a regulatory fee as allowed under Proposition 218.	Public Works	Agree The Public Works Strategic Plan process will evaluate and identify the necessary resources, and if funding is insufficient, a recommendation will be made to consider an Integrated Waste Management Fee or other appropriate mechanism to fund additional staffing and/or outreach needs.	December 2019	<p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</p> <p><b><u>January 23, 2018 Update:</u></b>  <b>Partially Implemented</b>                      Since September 2016, Public Works has hired the Zero Waste Division's Solid Waste &amp; Recycling Manager, Greg Apa, and Recycling Program Manager, Heidi Obermeit, who have 29 and 10 years, respectively, of solid waste industry experience. With their extensive background in the solid waste industry, they are in the process of reviewing, assessing and addressing Zero Waste's current efforts to educate and as needed the expansion of educational outreach to the community members and commercial businesses, both existing and new. Outreach educational materials are somewhat dated and these materials may be updated and customized as required with more current graphics and narratives.                      In addition, the ZWD has hired a Field Service Representative who assists ZWD's education and compliance efforts with all community members and businesses.                      In 2018, the current Council approved rate structure will require an updated rate study including the cost of increased educational outreach and training for handling of recyclable materials to ensure a sustainable rate structure to achieve the zero waste goals that the Council has set for Public Waste and Zero Waste Division.</p> <p><b><u>March 12, 2019</u></b>  <b>Partially Implemented</b>                      Public Works has determined through internal budget process that Zero Waste needs two additional full-time staff members to oversee the education, outreach, compliance, and enforcement necessary to reach zero-waste goals. The Zero Waste Division will be determining additional funding beyond staffing needed to increase education, outreach, compliance, and enforcement during the strategic planning process. The RFP for the strategic plan process is currently under administrative review. This process will also identify if the current levels of fees can cover the costs of the City's Zero Waste program or if Public Works will need to assess additional fees.</p>



## ATTACHMENT No. 1

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal					
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary	
			November 2021          July 2023	<p><b>March 24, 2020</b> <b>Partially Implemented</b> July 2019, City Council approved the hiring two additional full-time staff members to oversee the education, outreach, compliance, and enforcement necessary to reach zero waste goals. At a September 17, 2019 City Council Work Session on the current Rate Review Study, Council provided Public Works and its consultant direction to provide ongoing and additional services to be funded by the Zero Waste Fund. An update of the Rate Review Study will be scheduled with the City Council mid-2020.</p> <p><b>November 13, 2022 Update</b> <b>Dropped</b> Revised 5-year Rate Schedules was presented at the December 7, 2021 City Council Work Session. Council consented to moving forward with Proposition 218 process for property owner consent of the revised Rates as proposed. These Revised Schedules included additional costs for: 1) Ecology and CCC contracts (\$85 mil over 10 years, sole sourced per Council direction); staffing for AB 341 &amp; 1826, SB1383 and Single Use Disposal Plastic and Litter Reduction Ordinance compliance; and CEQA compliance work for Transfer Station Replacement Concepts A and B. In January 2022, The City Agenda Committee placed the revised 5-year rate schedules on pause.</p>	
1.6	Update the City's Zero Waste website to include easily accessible information regarding:	Public Works	Agree	October 2016	<p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</p> <p><b>January 23, 2018 Update:</b> <b>Implemented</b> With the hiring of the Recycle Program Manager, ZWD is continuously streamlining and updating the City's and ZWD's website to include: guidelines to recycle plant debris and food waste; information on the mandatory recycling requirements for businesses and multi-family properties in Alameda County; and links to other recycling resources in the area. Further, the ZWD has made available guidelines to help designers of multifamily, commercial, and mixed-use buildings plan for recycling collection when designing new buildings or renovations. In conjunction with the City's Public Information Officer, the ZWD has distributed press releases to educate the general public about the appropriate material to place in their refuse, recycling and green compost carts, extra pick-up bags, proper cart placement.</p>

## ATTACHMENT No. 1

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Zero waste goals and progress toward those goals.</li> </ul> <p><a href="http://StopWaste.org">StopWaste.org</a> is a good example and has resources that Berkeley can direct customers to use.</p> <p>Updates should be made as changes are made to the list of materials accepted through each waste stream.</p>				
1.7 Engage in discussions with the California Department of Resources Recycling and Recovery to obtain permission to collect garbage biweekly instead of weekly while maintaining weekly collection of compostables. Perform additional education and outreach prior to implementing biweekly garbage service to educate the public on the change. Alternatively, seek permission to implement a pilot project for biweekly garbage service.	Public Works	<p>Agree</p> <p>The ZWD will investigate the process of obtaining legal permission to pilot biweekly rubbish collection. We will identify the operational and outreach preparation necessary to evaluate the feasibility of this pilot.</p>	N/A	<p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</p> <p><b>January 23, 2018 Update:</b></p> <p><b>Dropped</b></p> <p>Although a Solid Waste &amp; Recycling Manager and Recycling Program Manager is on staff, the Zero Waste Division, as an enterprise funded collection service division, is unstaffed and inexperienced to engage in the process change of State Law, which requires weekly collection of refuse. In addition, this would require significant lobbying of CalRecycle to approve a pilot program to collect refuse other than on a weekly basis.</p> <p>The Audit Report states that there is the potential of \$496,000 annual cost savings by switching to biweekly garbage service. However, and as noted in the Audit Report, this is based on assumptions which:</p> <p>1) State law requires the refuse shall not remain on any premises more than seven (7) days. Berkeley would need to revise the State law, request a waiver or seek permission for a pilot program. This waiver or revision of State law will potentially require substantial lobbying members of City Council, State House of Representative(s) and Senator(s), as well as, of all the many County and State permitting and health agencies that would be involved to amend State law.</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
				2) Require additional staff and funding to support a community educational outreach to ensure that refuse is not just reallocated by community members to the recycling and plant debris carts. 3) Public Works would need to enter into negotiations with the employee bargaining unit to an agreement whether positions can be eliminated through attrition or reassignment.
<b>Finding 2: Limited use of available technologies affects operational efficiencies</b>				
2.1	Work with the Department of Information Technology to configure the CRM system with a required field that auto populates valid route information based on address and service delivery type so that route specific data can be collected on a going-forward basis.	Public Works	Agree	<p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</p> <p><b>December 2019</b> <u>January 23, 2018 Update:</u> <b>Not implemented</b> Currently the City is implementing an Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) project to replace the FUND\$ system including the CRM application. ERP is a software with financial (accounting, billing, budget, contracts) and human resource (time entry, personnel, payroll, benefits) applications. As part of this project, ZWD has been working with IT and its consultant during the needs assessment phase to ensure that RouteSmart™ will interface with the selected software. <u>June 4, 2018 Update:</u> <b>Not implemented</b> IT with ZWD is soliciting many companies to demonstrate their invoicing, customer service, and routing systems. With the conclusion of the demonstrations, IT will develop an RFP that will soloist proposals for systems that will integrate with Erma.</p> <p><b>December 2019</b> <u>March 12, 2019</u> <b>Not Implemented</b> IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on October 18, 2018. As the FUND\$ system is in the process of being replaced, a new system was deemed necessary and IT issued an RFP for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System and a Route Optimization System. One proposal was received. If the proposal is accepted, software installation and implementation is anticipated to begin immediately upon contract execution in May 2019, with software operational by December 2019. The new system will require route optimization and will have an onboard system for drivers containing route information based on address and service delivery type so that route-specific data can be</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
			<p>November 2022</p> <p>July 2024</p>	<p>collected on a going-forward basis. The details of this system will be evaluated and developed as part of implementation.</p> <p>In addition to these new systems, Public Works and Parks are also implementing a new computerized maintenance management system. Once that vendor has been selected, then 311 will issue an RFP for a new Customer Relationship Management system that will integrate with the Zero Waste solutions.</p> <p><b><u>March 24, 2020 Update</u></b>  <b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>IT is finalizing the contract the new Zero Waste software management system and to be completed late 2020. After this in operation, RFPs will be issued for new Routing and CRM system. When these are operational, CRM will be able to integrate routing information.</p> <p><b><u>November 13, 2022 Update</u></b>  <b>Dropped</b></p> <p>Contract awarded to AMCS to install new customer account &amp; financial software platform to be up and running by mid-2024.</p>
2.2	Public Works	<p>Agree</p> <p>Zero Waste will work with IT to create the most efficient link between RouteSmart™ and the CRM system that can be created, given available resources. One solution, budget permitting, would be implementing the best of breed billing system that integrates with RouteSmart, rather than to trying to configure the CRM system to handle functions it was never designed to handle.</p>	<p>April 2015</p> <p>December 2019</p>	<p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</p> <p><b><u>January 23, 2018 Update:</u></b>  <b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>IT has been able to create a table that extracts customer information from the FUNDS and RouteSmart™. However, and due to the limitations of FUNDS, this link takes hours to download information into RouteSmart™ versus that the company states should take minutes. Therefore, until the installation of the ERP process is completed, RouteSmart™ cannot be used to its full route optimization capabilities.</p> <p><b><u>March 12, 2019</u></b>  <b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>Working with RouteSmart™ for further integration was deemed not worthwhile as that system does not integrate with ArcGIS which is the City's primary system for spatial data. IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on October 18, 2018. The RFP was for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System and a Route Optimization System. One proposal was received. If the proposal is</p>

## ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
<b>Findings and Recommendations</b>	<b>Lead Dept.</b>	<b>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</b>	<b>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</b>	<b>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</b>
			<p>November 2022</p> <p>August 2024</p>	<p>accepted, software installation and implementation is anticipated to begin immediately upon contract execution in May 2019, with software operational by December 2019. In addition to these new systems, Public Works and Parks are also implementing a new computerized maintenance management system. Once that vendor has been selected, then 311 will issue an RFP for a new Customer Relationship Management system that will integrate with the Zero Waste solutions.</p> <p><b><u>March 24, 2020 Update:</u></b> <b>Not Implemented</b> After evaluating various applications and discussed by IT, IT-CS and PW, a link between RouteSmart and CRM cannot be installed. Therefore, the first step of soliciting a new Zero Waste software management system. Then, an RFP for new routing software will be issued. In IT-CS will be soliciting a new CRM system.</p> <p><b><u>November 13, 2022 Update</u></b> <b>Dropped</b> Contract awarded to AMCS to install new customer account &amp; financial software platform to be up and running by mid-2024.</p>
2.3	Appoint individuals at the management, supervisory, and line staff levels to meet and identify Zero Waste Division operational and analytical reporting needs based on the performance goals at each level of the organization. Work with IT staff to determine responsibility and establish timelines for developing the reports.	Public Works	Agree.	<p>September 2016</p> <p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</p> <p><b><u>January 23, 2018 Update:</u></b> <b>Implemented</b> ZWD along with IT, 311 Call Center, and Revenue Collection have established a monthly meeting to address operational and reporting needs; and create action plans to address those identified needs. These monthly reports included reviewing and analyzing as a Group: 1) monthly 311 calls on various the community members zero waste issues, 2) develop resolutions on community members' zero waste issues (reviewed weekly by 311 and ZWD personnel), and 3) review and resolve community members' LAGAN cases created by 311 calls.</p>
2.4	Designate a business-line expert within the	Public Works	Agree	<p>December 2018</p> <p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</p> <p><b><u>January 23, 2018 Update:</u></b></p>





## ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
<b>Findings and Recommendations</b>	<b>Lead Dept.</b>	<b>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</b>	<b>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</b>	<b>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</b>
<p>route books and other mobile field reporting. Include in the assessment changes to job responsibilities that might require a meet and confer with union representatives. Purchase the software and hardware if cost beneficial.</p>			<p>December 2019</p> <p>January 2021</p> <p>August 2024</p>	<p>City's ERP project vendor selected, contract awarded and then ZWD/IT needs assessment completed.</p> <p><b><u>March 12, 2019</u></b> <b>Partially Implemented</b> IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on October 18, 2018. The RFP was for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System and a Route Optimization System. These systems will utilize onboard mobile hardware. In addition, this system will integrate with the new GPS solution which will integrate with the Zero Waste solution allowing for real time decision making and route information. Exact capabilities of both systems will be validated and coordinated as part of the contracting process once the vendors are selected.</p> <p><b><u>March 24, 2020 Update</u></b> <b>Partly Implemented</b> IT released an RFP for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System will allow a follow-up RFP for Route Optimization System on October 18, 2018. One proposal was received. IT and Legal are in the process of finalizing a contract with the vendor with software installation to follow. Once this system is installed and operating, an RFP for onboard truck/route/customer reporting system may be released.</p> <p><b><u>November 13, 2022 Update</u></b> <b>Dropped</b> Contract awarded to AMCS to install new customer account &amp; financial software platform to be up and running by mid-2024.</p>
2.6 Work jointly with the Department of Information Technology and the Department of Finance to develop and automate script flows in the CRM system to ensure that all cases undergo the appropriate	Public Works	Agree	October 2016	<p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</p> <p><b><u>January 23, 2018 Update:</u></b> <b>Implemented</b> ZWD, IT, 311 Call Center, and Finance have developed script flows with use of the CRM tracking systems to ensure all cases receive appropriate review prior to closing. These cases are compiled and reviewed weekly and monthly by ZWD, IT, 311 Call Center, and Finance staff.</p>

## ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
<b>Findings and Recommendations</b>	<b>Lead Dept.</b>	<b>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</b>	<b>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</b>	<b>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</b>
<p>reviews before a case can be closed. The final step in the script flow should be a final review by someone who has authority to verify that all required steps have occurred before the case is closed.</p>				
<p>2.7 Use the reports developed from implementing recommendation 2.4 To monitor customer complaints and determine what impact the annual bid process has on customer service. If the information demonstrates the annual bid process significantly affects customer service, meet and confer with union representatives to discuss the elimination the annual route bidding process to help reduce customer complaints and improve service delivery. Implement change if</p>	Public Works	<p>Agree Zero Waste will use the CRM system to monitor customer complaints and help assess the effect of the yearly bid process.</p>	<p>January 2019</p> <p>June/August 2019</p> <p>January 2021</p>	<p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted <u>January 23, 2018 Update:</u> <b>Not Implemented</b> ZWD services 62 commercial route days and these ZWD's routes include: 42 refuse route days, 11 fiber (cardboard, paper) route days, 5 mixed recyclable route days and 6 plant debris/food waste routes days. After the new commercial accounts are optimized with existing commercial accounts/routes, ZWD will be in the position to numerically determine if the annual bid system is affecting customer service. With this information completed, this would enable ZWD to meet and confer with the Union. <u>June 4, 2018 Update:</u> <b>Not Implemented</b> With the integration of an additional 440 commercial accounts (had been serviced by either Waste Management, Inc. or Republic Services, Inc.) completed March/April 2018, with existing commercial accounts/routes, ZWD is in the position to numerically determine if the annual bid system is affecting customer service in April 2019. When this information is completed, ZWD will have information to meet and confer with the Union. <u>March 12, 2019</u> <b>Not Implemented</b> The annual bid process is set to begin February 2019 and its impacts will be evaluated June 2019. <u>March 24, 2020 Update:</u> <b>Dropped</b> Meet and confer with SEIU 1021 is ongoing and the Route Bid system as currently handled is in place. With the completion of the meet and confer, it will be reassessed at that time.</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
agreement is reached.				
2.8 Create a method for community members to track the status of their cases online, which will reduce the call volume to the 311 Call Center.	Information Technology	Agree This functionality will be available after the upgrade of our CRM system is complete, currently scheduled to be no later than the end of FY 2015.	June 2016  June 2020  January 2022	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted  <b>January 23, 2018 Update:</b> <b>Not Implemented</b> Currently 311 team members create cases and assigned them to the appropriate service queue for ZWD investigation and response. This system allows the City to internally track issues but the ability of community member to track independently or via the City website has not been linked. Currently the City is implementing an Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) project to replace the FUNDS\$ system and to update the City website. With the installation of the selected ERP, then the CRM system can be integrated with the ERP system. This integration would allow community members' to track their issues, such as, missed pickups, cost of service, etc. only. <b>March 12, 2019</b> <b>Not Implemented</b> IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on October 18, 2018 for a complete Zero Waste Solution. Software installation and implementation is anticipated to begin immediately upon contract execution in May 2019, with software operational by December 2019. Subsequently, IT will be issuing an RFP for a new 311 system to replace LAGAN that will integrate with the Zero Waste solution. One of the objectives of these new systems is to provide customers the ability to track their requests. <b>March 24, 2020 Update</b> <b>Partially Implemented</b> IT released an RFP for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System will allow a follow-up RFP for Route Optimization System on October 18, 2018. One proposal was received. IT and Legal are in the process of finalizing a contract with the vendor with software installation to follow. Once this system is installed and operating, an RFP for onboard truck/route/customer reporting system may be released. With an onboard system linked to Customer Relationship Management (CRM)

ATTACHMENT No. 1

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
			August 2024	reporting system, customers could track status of their cases, such as, missed pickups, late routes, etc <b>November 13, 2022 Update</b> <b>Dropped</b> Contract awarded to AMCS to install new customer account & financial software platform to be up and running by mid-2024.